

1 Brian C. Rocca, S.B. #221576
brian.rocca@morganlewis.com
2 Sujal J. Shah, S.B. #215230
sujal.shah@morganlewis.com
3 Michelle Park Chiu, S.B. #248421
michelle.chiu@morganlewis.com
4 Minna Lo Naranjo, S.B. #259005
minna.naranjo@morganlewis.com
5 Rishi P. Satia, S.B. #301958
rishi.satia@morganlewis.com
6 **MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP**
One Market, Spear Street Tower
San Francisco, CA 94105
Telephone: (415) 442-1000
7
8 Richard S. Taffet, *pro hac vice*
richard.taffet@morganlewis.com
9 **MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP**
10 101 Park Avenue
New York, NY 10178
11 Telephone: (212) 309-6000
12 *Counsel for Defendants Google LLC, et al.*

13 Glenn D. Pomerantz, S.B. #112503
glenn.pomerantz@mto.com
14 Kuruvilla Olasa, S.B. #281509
kuruvilla.olasa@mto.com
Nicholas R. Sidney, S.B. #308080
nick.sidney@mto.com
15 **MUNGER, TOLLES & OLSON LLP**
350 South Grand Avenue, Fiftieth Floor
Los Angeles, California 90071
Telephone: (213) 683-9100
16
17 Kyle W. Mach, S.B. #282090
kyle.mach@mto.com
18 Justin P. Raphael, S.B. #292380
justin.rafael@mto.com
Emily C. Curran-Huberty, S.B. #293065
emily.curran-huberty@mto.com
Dane P. Shikman, S.B. #313656
dane.shikman@mto.com
19 **MUNGER, TOLLES & OLSON LLP**
560 Mission Street, Twenty Seventh Floor
San Francisco, California 94105
Telephone: (415) 512-4000
20
21 Jonathan I. Kravis, *pro hac vice*
jonathan.kravis@mto.com
22 **MUNGER, TOLLES & OLSON LLP**
601 Massachusetts Avenue NW, Suite 500E
Washington, D.C. 20001
Telephone: (202) 220-1100
23
24
25
26
27
28

Neal Kumar Katyal, *pro hac vice*
neal.katyal@hoganlovells.com
Jessica L. Ellsworth, *pro hac vice*
jessica.ellsworth@hoganlovells.com
HOGAN LOVELLS US LLP
555 Thirteenth Street, NW
Washington, D.C. 20004
Telephone: (202) 637-5600

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION**

IN RE GOOGLE PLAY STORE ANTITRUST LITIGATION

Case No. 3:21-md-02981-JD

This Document Relates To:

**DECLARATION OF JUSTIN P.
RAPHAEL IN SUPPORT OF
DEFENDANTS' MOTION FOR LEAVE
TO FILE SUPPLEMENTAL BRIEF IN
SUPPORT OF DEFENDANTS' MOTION
TO EXCLUDE MERITS OPINIONS OF
DR. HAL J. SINGER**

In re Google Play Consumer Antitrust Litigation, Case No. 3:20-cv-05761-JD

State of Utah et al. v. Google LLC et al.,
Case No. 3:21-cv-05227-JD

Judge: Hon. James Donato
Date: August 3, 2023
Time: 10:00 a.m. Pacific Time
Courtroom: 11, 19th Floor, 450 Golden Gate Ave, San Francisco, California, 94102

DECLARATION OF JUSTIN P. RAPHAEL

I, Justin P. Raphael, hereby declare:

1. I am admitted to practice before all of the courts of the State of California and this Court. I am an attorney at the law firm of Munger, Tolles & Olson LLP and counsel of record for Defendants in the above-captioned matter. I have personal knowledge of the facts set forth in this declaration, and, if called as a witness, I could and would testify competently to the matters set forth herein

8 2. On October 3, 2022, Consumer Plaintiffs served on Google the Expert Report of
9 Hal J. Singer, Ph.D. On December 23, 2022, Consumer Plaintiffs served the Expert Reply Report
10 of Hal J. Singer, Ph.D. (“Singer Reply Report”). Attached hereto as **Exhibit A** is a true and
11 accurate copy relevant excerpts from the Singer Reply Report.

12 3. On April 20, 2023, Google filed its Motion to Exclude Merits Opinions of Dr. Hal
13 J. Singer (“Motion to Exclude”). On April 27, 2023, after Google filed its Motion to Exclude,
14 lead trial counsel for all member cases held an in-person trial “summit” to discuss a plan and
15 sequencing of the cases in this MDL for trial. At that trial summit, Google asked counsel for
16 Consumer Plaintiffs how Plaintiffs intended to prove damages for any individual plaintiffs at trial.
17 Google reiterated that inquiry by email on May 5, 2023, asking “how Plaintiffs intended to prove
18 damages for individual plaintiffs if they are going to be part of the trial.” Consumer Plaintiffs’
19 counsel responded on May 6, 2023, informing Google’s counsel that Plaintiffs “will be
20 supplementing the reports to provide the calculation of damages for the individual plaintiffs under
21 all of the models previously disclosed by Dr. Singer.” A true and correct copy of this
22 correspondence is attached hereto as **Exhibit B**.

23 4. On May 12, 2023, Consumer Plaintiffs served on Google a Supplemental Expert
24 Report of Hal J. Singer, Ph.D. Attached hereto as **Exhibit C** is a true and accurate copy of
25 relevant excerpts from this report.

26 5. On June 16, 2023, Google served on Plaintiffs a Supplemental Expert Rebuttal
27 Report by Dr. Gregory Leonard responding to Dr. Singer's Supplemental Expert Report. Attached

hereto as **Exhibit D** is a true and accurate copy of relevant excerpts from Dr. Leonard's rebuttal report.

6. More than three weeks after the close of briefing on Google’s Motion to Exclude, on June 30, 2023, Dr. Singer submitted a Supplemental Expert Reply Report, along with certain backup work papers. Attached hereto as **Exhibit E** is a true and accurate copy of relevant excerpts from that report. Attached hereto as **Exhibit F** is a true and accurate copy of relevant portions of those backup work papers.

8 7. Google deposed Dr. Singer regarding his supplemental reports on July 18, 2023.
9 Attached hereto as **Exhibit G** is a true and accurate copy of relevant excerpts from that deposition
10 transcript.

11 8. On July 25, 2023, I emailed counsel for Plaintiffs asking whether they would
12 stipulate to Google’s request for leave to file a supplemental brief in support of Google’s Motion
13 to Exclude the Merits Opinions of Dr. Singer. On July 26, 2023, Plaintiffs’ counsel indicated that
14 Plaintiffs would not stipulate to Google’s request for leave. A true and correct copy of my
15 correspondence with Plaintiffs’ counsel is attached hereto as **Exhibit H**.

16 I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States of America that the
17 foregoing is true and correct.

18 Executed on this 26th day of July, 2023, at San Francisco, California.

s/ Justin P. Raphael
Justin P. Raphael

1
2
E-FILING ATTESTATION

3
4 I, Sujal J. Shah, am the ECF User whose ID and password are being used to file this
5 document. In compliance with Civil Local Rule 5-1(h)(3), I hereby attest that counsel for
6 Defendants have concurred in this filing.

7
8 _____ /s/ *Sujal J. Shah*
9 Sujal J. Shah

10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28